Bias in Newspapers. A Comparative Critical Discourse Analysis of Newspapers' Reports about 'The Lady of Heaven' Film

ABSTRACT

Language is powerful since it can appeal to emotions and ideologies, and thus readers need to build a more objective judgment in the numerous news reports from different news media. It is completely beyond dispute that the media, in general, and movies, in particular, play a key role in the dissemination of information and the creation of realistic representations of everyday life through the effective use of language in social contexts. This article addresses media political bias and language usage in various news reports based on the study's objectives. The current study argues that even when various newspaper types refer to reports of the same incident, the language they employ is expressly different, and that knowledge of language usage patterns may help to explain this variety. This paper analyses some forms of linguistic bias in Tehran Times, Kuwait Times, The Guardian and Al-Estiklal. Richardson's model (2007) has been used to analyse four articles from different countries and thus different ideologies. The results of the analysis revealed that each newspaper presents the movie according to its ideology and hence biased to its point of view.

© 2022 EDUJ, College of Education for Human Science, Wasit University

DOI: https://doi.org/10.31185/eduj.Vol54.Iss2.3736
التحيز في الصحف. تحليل الخطاب النقدي المقارن لتقارير الصحف حول فيلم سيدة الجنة

م.م. رؤى حمداخيار
وزارة التربية / مديرية تربية واسط

الملخص

اللغة قوية لأنها يمكن أن تجذب المشاعر والأيديولوجيات، وبالتالي يحتاج القراء إلى بناء حكم أكثر موضوعية في التقارير الإخبارية المتعددة من وسائل الإعلام المختلفة. مما لا يزال فيه تمامًا أن وسائل الإعلام بشكل عام والأفلام بشكل خاص تلعب دورًا رئيسيًا في نشر المعلومات وإنشاء تمثيلات واقعية للحياة اليومية من خلال الاستخدام الفعال للغة في السياقات الاجتماعية. تتناول هذه المقالة التحيز الإعلامي واستخدام اللغة في التقارير الإخبارية المختلفة بناءً على أهداف الدراسة. يحل هذا البحث بعض أشكال التلاعب اللغوي في الصحف المختلفة عند تغطيتها لفيلم سيدة الجنة. تم استخدام نموذج ريتشاردسون (2007) لتحليل أربع مقالات صحيفية من بلدان مختلفة، وبالتالي أيديولوجيات مختلفة. أظهرت نتائج التحليل أن كل صحيفة تقدم الفيلم وفق أيديولوجيتها وبالتالي تتجاوز لوجهة نظرها.

الكلمات الافتتاحية: أيدولوجية، وسائل اخبارية، تحيز الإعلام، تحليل الخطاب

1. Introduction

As we read newspapers, we frequently are influenced by the writers' opinions and tend to form those opinions into our own. Although news is intended to be objective, articles published by reporters, who by themselves have a subjective view on the topic they are reporting on, and are edited by news boards that can have political agendas, are always infused with implicit (and explicit) biases. The vocabulary used in newspapers is very different from the language used in business or academia. As stated by Crystal and Davy (1969, P. 173) "everything that happens to be printed in a newspaper or written by a journalist is not going to be linguistically homogenous". Between the pages of several daily newspapers, we come across a variety of "authors," and it is interesting to note that while they all address the same topic, their general writing styles are considerably different.

All that is printed in a newspaper must be communicated through language. A message must have values encoded into it in order to be transmitted through language. Language therefore has emotional and cultural content. Contrarily, the kind of the society or subculture in which the language is present determines the content of this loading. (Reah, 1998). Furthermore, as demonstrated by Reah (1998, P. 55), the language used to describe ideas about particular people, concepts, or beliefs will reflect the attitude of the society in question. As a result, when these topics are written about, the language used to communicate them to the readers will reinforce their attitudes.
2. Critical Discourse Analysis of News Discourse

Fairclough introduced the critical study of language, which focuses on the relationships between language, power, and ideology (Fairclough, 1989). Since then, it has been widely used in research projects in a variety of fields, particularly in the analysis of news reports. Traditional approaches include the sociocultural approach developed by Fairclough (Fairclough, 1992), the sociocognitive approach developed by van Dijk (Van Dijk, 2008), and the discourse-historical approach developed by Wodak (2000). Currently, news reports are one of the primary sources from which people learn about events both locally and globally. All media claim that their reports are objective, yet every news item inevitably reflects the ideology of its author and nation, which can be utilized to twist the truth.

Critical Discourse Analysis has been used to analyse news discourse since the 1970s. In his book (Linguistics and Criticism), Fowler (1986) examined the headlines of some news articles and made the observation that news discourse is never an objective depiction of reality but rather a means of spreading ideology. Van Dijk, the author of several books on news analysis, is the first to discuss bias and racism in discourse (1991, p. 198). In his book (Racism and Press), he pointed out that “implications, suggestions, presuppositions and other implicit, indirect or vague means of expressing underlying meaning or opinions may be used to persuade readers to the point of view of the newspaper”. Fairclough primarily concentrated on the disguised ideologies in news reporting, and in Media Discourse, he covered several methods to media discourse, including linguistic, conversational, semiotic, and sociocognitive analysis, etc. and introduced his sociocultural approach (Fairclough, 1995a). He contended in his book Critical Discourse Analysis that news media discourse representation can be viewed as an ideological process that is susceptible to social variables and social repercussions (Fairclough, 1995b, p. 65).

The news reporting genre has drawn interest from academics researching sociology, political discourse, and linguistics. In particular, linguistic research has looked into various writing vocabularies and language choices in news reporting. A key aspect of media discourse is news reporting, which tries to enlighten a large audience about current events. Consequently, media are the philosophical of society, and in this respect, Oktar (2001) argued, “the media do not passively describe or record news events, but actively reconstruct them, mostly on the basis of their own ideological affiliations” (p.320). Fairclough (1995) claimed that ideology participates language “in producing or interpreting a text, and the ways they are articulated together in orders of discourse through both lexical meanings and “presuppositions, implicatures, metaphors, and coherence, all aspects of meaning” (p.74). This range in investing ideology yield to “establishing a categorical and authoritative and decisive image than with giving information” (Fairclough, 1995, p.75).

After discussing the connection between media and ideology, it is important to emphasize that language is the essential tool for conveying an ideology in the media. According to Xie (2013) “languages are meaning potentials that provide users with choices, arranged as system networks, about how to express their thoughts. At the level of lexis, the ideological implications of this fact are widely recognized"(p.42).
3. Bias Categories

When analysing speech, both the content and the context are crucial. According to Blommaert (1999), discourse cannot be understood solely in terms of the linguistic aspects of the text; rather, it is a complex relationship in which both the sociocultural setting and the linguistic features of the text must be taken into account. According to Richardson (2007), combining text and context helps one comprehend the discursive techniques journalists frequently employ to create writings that reflect their opinions. As a result, the way an issue is represented in the media is not a direct reflection of reality but rather involves a number of creating, sorting, and filtering processes.

In a similar vein, Fowler (1991) suggested that the mutual process of stereotyping between readers and authors has a significant impact on the language of news. A problem that is frequently presented in a negative light will be understood consciously or unconsciously in the same schema that mentally provokes fear, rage, and other unpleasant emotions. Consequently, Fowler (1991, p. 19) determined that reporting news can be influenced by the probability of classifying it within "a certain light of representation, and so selection involves an ideological act of interpretation". For that reason, Beard (2000) argued that "there is no such thing as unbiased report, no such thing as neutral language" (p. 18).

As a result, media bias has long been a problem. The tendency to portray something or someone favorably or unfavorably based on one's own point of view or prejudice rather than on the basis of facts and evidence is known as bias. According to Hamborg et al. (2018), bias in news can be enacted in a variety of ways, including choosing one news story over another, quoting some voices while omitting others, highlighting the reliability of some sources while downplaying the veracity of others, using either positive or negative lexical choices when relating to a person, group of people, or a topic, and eventually, the size and location of the article in newspapers to benefit more consideration over other topics.

According to MacLean (1988), bias can be carried out without a lot of authority, but propaganda does. In order to secure unquestioning support for the positions it promotes, propaganda always masks its true objective and motivation. Bias, on the other hand, conveys the content in a style that aims to elicit an emotional response from the audience. The ultimate objective that news sources attempt to be presented through is impartiality, and these two ideas represent the two extremes of that value.

According to Busa (2014), it is the "code of ethics" that signifies adherence to the principles of "truthfulness, accuracy, objectivity, impartiality, and fairness" in news reporting without regard to "personal feelings or political ideology." (p. 33). Several definitions of media bias center on the publications' propensity to favor one side of the political spectrum over the other. However "a political opinion is neither necessary nor sufficient to justify the conclusion that the news they produce would be biased" (Groeling, 2013, p.133). As a result, media bias is a strong opinion that is frequently not supported by a fair assessment in favor of or against a certain group of people or side in a debate.

The contextual bias can be demonstrated in detail by looking at headlines, subheads, tying the subject to other unflattering people, groups, causes, and ideas, publishing facts that
support the editors' opinions, and lastly the thoughts in the conclusion. Words that ascribe information to a person or group, like verbs, can demonstrate an attribution bias.

4. Conflict of Interest in Movies

Being a medium for both artistic expression and commercial success, film combines art and commerce. It is a form of expression founded on conflict and struggle. Although there are many artists working in film around the world, they hardly ever have control over the means of creation and hardly ever own their work. This is because, in comparison to almost any other piece of art, producing a film requires a significant investment of both effort and money.

The copyright and distribution rights, however, are still held by the studio and its parent company. So, different people with various film-related careers may have quite diverse ideas about what a film is really about. Many filmmakers, actresses, and performers use it as a form of self-expression, a way to discover and refine their artistic abilities. It is a difficult investment for the executive producer, but one that could yield fantastic returns. The marketing manager sees it as a product that can come in various forms but ultimately aims to appeal to as many people as possible.

Yasser Al-Habib wrote the historical drama film The Lady of Heaven. The movie, which was made by Enlightened Kingdom, is the first to focus on the early Muslim era life of historical figure Fatima (PBUH), a daughter of the Islamic prophet Muhammad. The narrative of Fatimah is told from a Shia perspective, which is very different from that of Sunni Muslims. The Lady of Heaven was scheduled for release in 2020, but like many other films, it was postponed as a result of COVID-19 pandemic-related industry uncertainty. The movie had its American premiere on December 10, 2021, according to an announcement made on October 25, 2021.

Following protests, screenings at a Bolton movie theater were canceled. In order to "protect the safety" of their employees and customers. The UK revocation received criticism for being "dangerous for free speech" and "disastrous for the arts." The British Humanist Association, which highlighted the repeal of blasphemy legislation in England and Wales since 2008, voiced similar concerns. The film's producer acknowledged that protesters have the right to their opinions to be heard, but claimed that removing the movie would go against British ideals. Iran, Pakistan, Egypt, and Morocco have all outlawed the movie.

5. Methodology

The type of analysis used in this study is qualitative. Instead of creating a broad picture based on classifications or frequencies, which are the general characteristics of quantitative studies, the goal of this sort of study is to explore a specific event and dig carefully into articles in detail. Similar to this, Bryman (2012) defined qualitative procedures as those that allow the researcher to view the situation from the perspective of the people involved.

Van Dijk (1988) supported this type of approach while expressing that, in light of this "such analyses are necessary to establish not only what but also how the world press covers events in different countries” (p.35).
Four articles from different countries were selected to find out how those countries biased to their perspective about the film. The researcher chose Teheran Times, Kuwait Times, The Guardian and Al-Estiklal. The reasons behind choosing those newspapers from different nationalities were because all these newspapers are published in English and each one has its own perspective about the film. The author of the film was from Kuwait, and that why Kuwait Times had been chosen. Choosing a British newspaper was because most actors were from Britain and the film is a British produced. Tehran Times was chosen because the author of the film spent a lot of his life time in Iran and had got his education there. However, it is widely believed that the news media is biased. What remains to be seen, though, is how and where bias in reporting might be found. Richardson (2007) responds to this concern by introducing "Language as the medium to do so" (pp. 13–14). He analyses the language use in newspapers and labels language as a "non-neutral element" in an effort to demonstrate how "the use of language" may alter the meanings of ideas as well as turn them in some extreme circumstances. Thus, Using Richardson (2007) model to analyse the newspapers texts was because it is the best model dealt with newspapers manipulation and bias. The examination of newspaper discourse began with a look at textual analysis. To explore them in connection to real newspaper texts, a few linguistic notions and methods were initially provided. According to Richardson's approach, linguistic analysis of news reports progresses from small-scale (micro) study of individual words to larger-scale examination of how meaning is organized across a document. The model for this study is presented below.

6. Data Analysis

In selecting a qualitative analysis, the researcher must give a thorough explanation of the analytical steps. The news pieces, which are all connected to political bias with varying confirmations, are gathered by the researcher from four online publications owned by different nationalities. The chosen articles are categorized into short parts, sentences, or paragraphs in accordance with the essential elements of the dedicated model for analysis. The goal of the qualitative approach that was chosen is to provide a more thorough critical and comparative study of the chosen news texts.
The initial phase of any text or discourse is nearly always the analysis of specific words used in a newspaper text. Words, in particular, communicate both connoted and denoted meanings leaving a mark of society and value judgments. Words of all kinds, but especially nouns, verbs, adjectives, and adverbs, have, connotative as well as explicit meanings. Thus, the choice and meaning of words will be analysed first.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive words</th>
<th>Negative words</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a Shiite cleric</td>
<td>an extremist Shiite cleric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the spiritual leader</td>
<td>radical extremists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This British-made epic earns a significant accolade</td>
<td>Sectarian Ideological Film</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inflaming Hate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>extremist religious channels</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Arguments may be made that the alternatives in each of these pairs might have been used as references to the same person, or activity, but due to ideological restrictions. The language chosen to convey a text's message, whether it be about a single person, a group of people, an event, or any other topics or themes in newspaper stories, frames the narrative in overt and inescapable ways. And in newspapers that convey the point of view regarding the movie, the framing of these texts obtained via such decisions show how racialization—an extreme Shiite cleric and a Shiite cleric—often underlay certain writers' choice of descriptive phrases.

Examining the deeper meanings and discourses behind the words in news items can show the cognitive and social functions of language choice when media bias is paired with linguistic patterns. Generally speaking, the believability of information is influenced by the language's structure, particularly by its complexity. Targeted news can potentially contain bias and have an impact on readers' interpretations of the events as well as the objectivity of the news as a whole.

People's perceptions can be significantly impacted by how they are referred to in news discourse. The way social actors are called might indicate not only the groups they belong to (or at least the groupings the author wants them to belong to), but also the connection between the namer and the named. As Blommaert (2005, p. 11) explained "Apart from referential meaning, acts of communication produce indexical meaning: social meaning, interpretative leads between what is said and the social occasion in which it is being produced". Writers are required to give names for the participants in the events they cover, and this naming process is always subjective. And therefore, by selecting one social category over another, they include them in the selected category and remove them from other categories. Alternatively, they may decide to emphasize a certain social category above other equally valid options. These name alternatives, which Reisigle and Wodak (2001, p. 47) referred to as a text's "referential strategies, show how one might choose to refer to a person or a group as one thing or as another and can serve many different psychological, social or
political purposes… on the side of the speakers or the writers". The examples below demonstrate the analysis.

"Cinema witnessed a new crisis with the release of The Lady of Heaven …but from a Shiite perspective".

"It is noteworthy that the writer of The Lady of Heaven film is Sheikh Yasser Al-Habib, an extremist Shiite cleric who lives in England and was born in Kuwait".

(Jandali, M. 2022, Al-Estiklal Newspaper)

"Ambitious religious epic about Muhammad’s daughter".

(Hoad, P. 30 May, 2022, The Guardian)

"Sheikh Yasser Al-Habib has written the screenplay. He is a Kuwaiti Shia Muslim cleric, and the head of the London-based Khoddam Al-Mahdi Organization. Al-Habib attempts to express his religious views, and his investigations and conclusions concerning Islamic history based upon Shia and Sunni sources. (Tehran Times, December 29, 2020)

It can be seen from these excerpts the way words were chosen to create a particular effect. “There are always alternative ways of signifying particular domains of experience, which entails interpreting in a particular way… As one changes wording, one also changes the meaning” (Fairclough, 1992, pp. 190-192). The process of choosing vocabulary for a work may be seen of as one that is impacted by the social environment, ideologies, and power dynamics of the time. As a result, the words chosen typically express the writer's philosophy and attitude toward the subject matter. it can be seen that the newspapers shape completely different images of the writer of the film. Sometimes described as being (an extremist Shiite cleric) and on the other hand the newspapers used only the term (Al Sheikh). This denotes that the newspaper wants to put the writer of the film in the sectarian realm.

A critical linguistic tool for the examination of a range of media texts is the transitivity pattern. According to Simpson (1995, p. 104), it is a well-liked component of the work's analytical collection within the critical linguistics tradition. It has been used to show how certain meanings are emphasized while others are hidden or obscured. Thus, one technique to investigate how a reader's or listener's interpretation of a text is steered in a certain direction and how a text's linguistic structure successfully encodes a particular "world-view" is through the transitivity model. Of course, this viewpoint will be held by the author(s) of the work.

According to Simpson "…the choice whether to include or omit agency from a process constitutes an important part of message construction." (Simpson 1995, p. 94). The examples below demonstrate this

Muslim activists and pioneers of social media have also exposed the falsity of the historical events presented in the film under the hashtag #TheLadyOfHeaven, stressing that the film is a mine of sectarian hate and distorts the image of the Prophet Muhammad and the Rightly-Guided Caliphs.
"The film has received intense criticism since the announcement of the start of production"  
(Al-Estiklal Newspaper)

"Morocco bans film about daughter of Prophet Mohammed"  
"The Lady of Heaven" will not receive a license to be shown in the country, the Moroccan Cinematographic Centre (CCM) said in a statement issued late Saturday".  
(Kuwait Times, 12, 6, 2022)

"Nevertheless, Al-Habib has claimed that his film conveys a message of love and peace".  
December (29, 2020Tehran Times)

"The film-makers are Shia, a branch of Islam that has sometimes been observed as more lenient on the issue, and the film is written by Sheikh al-Habib, the spiritual leader of The Mahdi Servants Union".  
The Guardian (Mon, 30 May 2022)

Because the newspaper makes a point of mentioning persons who are in control of various acts, the high percentage of active phrases is remarkable. As a result, the active voice is the favored form because it replicates how people perceive and receive information and enables the reporter to explain activities in a way that is more straightforward and understandable.

The second part of the sentence construction is presupposition. Discourse frequently makes use of presuppositions. Although they are only hinted at briefly in the text, they are essential to interpretation and the creation of coherence.

These assumptions are founded on the readers' knowledge and ideas as they are portrayed in the models, scripts, and attitudes. In this approach, the journalists might imply the importance of such presumptive claims, if not their veracity. The reader is encouraged to draw the appropriate conclusions but is not directly faced with them. Clearly, this is a highly subtle and effective meaning-production tactic.

"On the other hand, the objection of Muslim activists about The Lady of Heaven film came on the grounds that the work was written by a Shiite cleric that would stoke sectarian tensions between Shiites and Sunnis".  
(Al-Estiklal Newspaper)

"Egypt, Pakistan, Iran and Iraq are among the countries to have denounced the film as blasphemous".  
(Kuwait Times)

"Al-Habib attempts to express his religious views, and his investigations and conclusions concerning Islamic history based upon Shia and Sunni sources".  
(Tehran Times)

In some instances, the media may indirectly and occasionally very obliquely present facts that the readers are completely unaware of but that are just implied to be common knowledge. The authors analyzed implicit or hidden meaning in the explicit media content using presupposition. They are genuinely curious in the veracity of the claims that language users make about the readers or listeners. That is, in certain instances, the presumption or assumed knowledge is completely false. By using this type of assumption, speakers or authors attempt to influence the comprehension of their listeners or readers.
Concerning the last phase of analysis which is rhetorical tropes, there are different rhetorical figure of speech. According to Richardson (2007, p. 65) "journalists are unable to provide reports of events that are entirely true and objective, they employ rhetorical strategies aimed at persuading others to adopt same point of view". The first trope is hyperbole. Exaggerating something repeatedly for rhetorical purpose is known as hyperbole. Hyperbole's first component is exaggeration. When someone uses hyperbole, they are exaggerating an aspect or feature. Exaggeration is typically used by speakers to highlight the significance of a certain point. Hyperbole uses false assertions to emphasize the significance and degree of the topic being discussed. The examples given below will serve as an example:

"stressing that the film is a mine of sectarian hate and distorts the image of the Prophet Muhammad and the Rightly-Guided Caliphs".

"The extremist cleric also launched the Fadak channel, which was classified by the BBC as one of the most extremist religious channels that inflame hate in 2014".

(Al-Estiklal Newspaper)

"the film was a flagrant falsification of the established facts of the history of Islam"

(Kuwait Times)

It is noted here that the two newspapers tried to strength the expressiveness and persuasion of their view about the film. The disparity between the literal meaning and the intended meaning was significant enough for the hearer to realize that the two writers were able to exaggerate to a point that enables the hearer understands that this is an exaggerated statement especially when the writer described the film as (a mine of sectarian hate). If it isn't, there's a potential the listener won't recognize the use of hyperbole or the statement may come out as uninteresting.

The second rhetorical tropes that are used in the analysis is metonym. Metonymy includes substituting the name of something with something that is related to it, without being the whole thing. On the other hand, Richardson (2007) described a metonym as a trope in which one word, phrase, or object is replaced by another from a field of reference that is semantically similar. Examples below serve

"THE PROPHET’S DAUGHTER — A FILM FROM A SHIITE PERSPECTIVE THAT ANGERS BRITISH MUSLIMS FOR THESE REASONS"

"The film caused chaos in the vicinity of Cineworld cinemas, which decided to stop its showing, and later Showcase Cinemas also withdrew the controversial film".

(Al Astiklal Newspaper)

"This British-made epic earns a significant accolade"

"The production values are decent, with impressive mud-brick sets and the kohl-eyed, vibrant-cloaked pagan rabble contrasting nicely with the austere Muslim camp"

(Guardian)
From a discourse analytic viewpoint, a metonym's meaning is dependent on how it is utilized, not just if it appears in a text. On the other side, metonyms could allow authors to imagine actors who are accountable, involved, or impacted. The writer in the examples above used the term Shite instead of mentioning the name of the movie's writer to present the idea the movie is not a single man made but the whole Shiites. On the other hand, the Guardian used the phrase (British made epic) to denote that the film is a British.

7. Conclusion

This research aims to analyze the language expression and manifestation of ideological bias in the news discourse on the movie Lady of Heaven. This research compared the vocabulary used by the four newspapers, each of which had a different political ideology, as they covered the same incident. Diverse ideological and linguistic perspectives have been proven to prevent the possibility of objective reporting since they are invariably conveyed in news language. This study has demonstrated that by reporting and shifting the articles in various ways, language may reveal underlying beliefs.

In short, the mass media simply cannot offer a viewpoint that is completely devoid of subjective interpretation of events; rather, media organizations often manufacture reality in a way that is consistent with their basic ideological and political purposes. In essence, the study showed that one of the key factors leading to a biased depiction of news articles is the use of linguistic tools. In addition, the findings demonstrated that western publications, especially those published in the United States and the United Kingdom, use language that is quite ideological when reporting on disagreements. Finally, it was noted that these ideological portrayals and biased terminology in the news media might legitimize one side while suppressing the other.

Overall, however, it can be said that newspapers use various approaches when reporting the same event in an effort to sway readers' opinions in accordance with each newspaper's political ideologies, thereby restricting the freedom of speech, even though most people believe and assert that newspapers have a free press.
References


Hoad, P. (Mon 30 May 2022). The lady of heaven review – ambitious religious epic about Muhammad’s daughter.


https://www.alestiklal.net/en/view/13857/


MacLean, E. (1988). *Between the lines: How to detect bias and propaganda in the news and everyday life*. Montreal, Quebec: Black Rose Books Ltd.


